GWDB Operations Committee Special Meeting Minutes

Tuesday, March 27, 2018 - 10:00 a.m. to 12:00 Noon

Boundary Waters Conference Room - Department of Employment and Economic Development (DEED)

332 Minnesota Street -Suite E200 - Saint Paul, Minnesota 55101

# Members Present via Conference Call

* Shirley Barnes
* Luann Bartley
* Charlene Briner
* Steve Ditschler
* Lorrie Janatopoulos
* Mayor Elizabeth Kautz
* Anne Kilzer
* Loren Nelson
* Scott Parker
* Jovon Perry
* Traci Tapani
* Jeremy Hanson Willis

**Staff**

* Connie Ireland
* Kay Pollard
* Julie Kahn
* Kay Kammen
* Lisa Snyder
* Rick Roy

# Call to Order and Introductions

Chair Elizabeth Kautz called the meeting to order at 10:00 am. It was confirmed that attendees in the room and on the conference call constituted a quorum. Chair Kautz informed the committee that the only item on the agenda was discussion of proposed changes to the Combined State Plan.

**Combined State Plan presentation**

Connie Ireland reported on the quarterly GWDB meeting on March 7, during which two motions were made to move forward on the plan. The Board voted to submit the modified plan as is with minimal changes so Minnesota could meet the U.S. Department of Labor deadline of March 15 and the state could continue to be in compliance. Gender equity was addressed at length. The Board also agreed to gather and evaluate state data surrounding gender and, if warranted, revise the State Plan no later than the GWDB Quarterly Meeting in June and directed the Operations Committee to conduct a data review and discussion prior to the GWDB’s June meeting.

Both the Mayor and Connie shared the Governor’s request for the board to reconsider the addition of gender to the plan given the fact that U. S. DOL granted Minnesota an extension until April 2, 2018 for the submission of the modified plan with the public comment period extended as well. This follows the March 13th Operations Committee’s request for a special meeting of the Operations Committee plus a

full GWDB. Today’s meeting is the Operations Committee special meeting and the full board will be held on Thursday, March 29, 2018. Board staff have been working with DEED’s data analysts to gather gender and race/ethnicity data.

Connie Ireland’s PowerPoint presentation included the State Plan modification context, WIOA Core Program Parameter, and data analysis. The presentation included the recommendations brought forward as presented to staff by DEED. The changes to the goals included the inclusion of “skills training” and disconnected youth in goal #1. The data presented was inclusive of populations in the workforce, education, wage earnings and unemployment rates. Goal #2 included the gender with regard to disparities gaps within sectors inclusive of race, disability and gender which the data presented supports. Data was still being collected with regard to sub-categories with the Asian and Native American populations which will be included in the narrative of the plan. Chair Kautz outlined the process for today’s special meeting and stated that when Connie’s presentation arrives at each goal, the Chair will ask for comments so they are heard before Thursday’s special GWDB meeting. Mayor Kautz asked if there were questions on program parameters, and there were none. Connie Ireland proceeded to the data analysis portion of the presentation. Mayor Kautz clarified that this meeting is focused on the PowerPoint only based on the Governor’s directive.

Lorrie Janatopoulos stated that the GWDB’s Racial Equity Committee has also discussed intersection of race and gender and continued, that the labor force participation rate does not reflect salary. She stated that gender applies to all people but we’re talking about women because women have the most disparities in outcomes. Mayor Kautz mentioned the importance of the regional and local focus using that data for implementation strategies.

**New Proposed State Plan Goal #1**

Mayor Kautz asked to make the amendment to add “or gender” followed by a period to that sentence to Goal #1 and to eliminate the “to provide greater opportunity for all Minnesotans” text. Discussion followed. Jeremy Hanson Willis stated that he is not sure if he agrees with the amendment and gender inclusion belongs in Goal #2 noting that one goal is not more important than the other. Charlene Briner stated that she would support the Mayor’s proposed amendment and understood Jeremy Hanson Willis’ point. She noted that it’s based on program parameters as data truly supports wage disparities, which led her to conclude that gender belongs in each goal. Jovon Perry stated that she agreed with Jeremy Hanson Willis that gender should be included in Goal #2 and that EEO differs from equity. She stated that gender should have specific parameters related to local plans and regional profiles for a geographic look. Lorrie Janatopoulos said that she understood Jovon and that’s why the GWDB has an Equity Committee. Lorrie Janatopoulos continued that this is important work and we don’t want to lose sight that the most disparity is between white people and people of color and referenced Deb Fitzpatrick, (U of Minnesota) Humphrey School of Public Affairs’ data disparity in outcomes in workforce development programs themselves. Traci Tapani asked when it comes to disparity, how do we know it’s a workforce development issue as opposed to abuses by employers? Jeremy Hanson Willis spoke about employment, credential attainment and earnings as well as the importance of Goal #1 is to focus on the worst disparities and that Goal #2 focuses on sectors. Lorrie Janatopoulos inquired as to authority and does the board have the authority to make a recommendation to the Governor? Traci Tapani asked if the Governor approves of gender being included in Goal #2 and not in Goal #1, and are the Governor and Commissioner in alignment. Jeremy Hanson Willis answered yes.

Steve Ditschler suggested Goal #2 be addressed before the committee consider a vote on the motion.

**New Proposed State Plan Goal #2**

Connie outlined Goal #2. Shirley Barns stated that with respects to the plan, the responsibility of this committee, and the operation of the actual plan, is there data that would indicate that gender should not be in Goal #2? Connie presented the recommendation to amend Goal #2 to include gender equity. Mayor Kautz made a motion to approve the amended Goal #1 as stated (add “or gender”) and Lorrie Janatopoulos mad the seconded to the motion to amend Goal #1. Mayor Kautz asked if there were any new points for discussion. A discussion followed.

Jovon Perry asked what do we hope to gain by including gender in Goal #1? Mayor Kautz stated that we are highlighting gender to be consistent with Goal #2. Lorrie Janatopoulos stated that Goal #1 is the “What” and that the work is hard and that there is a timeline issue, not how we’re going to do the work issue. She said that this doesn’t mean we don’t put our focus on where the work is needed most. Jovon Perry stated that she wants to make sure that it’s understood that her comment does not mean that the work is too hard, but that it is to target and be intentional around address women of color and not EEO

issues. Loren Nelson stated that as a white man, he holds his judgment in high suspect and that looking at the information that has been presented he did not see any reason to not agree to the Mayor’s amendment. Jeremy Hanson Willis stated that Goal #1 and #2 are about the What/How. He continued that Goal #1 is about addressing disparities in programs and noted that since the private sector is not very well represented, he would address their needs. He said that Goal #2 is also what we need to focus on in a methodical way. Traci Tapani stated that from an industry perspective, access to opportunities and pay equity are important to her. She had concerns about changing plan mid-stream until we need to move into a new planning phase. Lorrie Janatopoulos said that Goal 1 relates to WIOA programs itself with the programs not having equal outcomes for men and women and that data should be disaggregated by race for men for accurate comparison. She continued, stating that the GWDB’s committees will need to focus on the goals which will provide oversight of progress. There were questions about why disconnected youth was now included, does the Governor only support adding gender to Goal #2, does the Governor think this is the best way to address gender, who is stating this? DEED? Governor? Mayor Kautz asked for discussion to end. As a point of order, Charlene Briner asked if Lorrie Janatopoulos’ questions could be answered before the vote. Jeremy Hanson Willis said that the Commissioner has been in consultation with Gov. and his staff.

The vote to amend Goal #1 to include “or gender” passed by a 9-Yes 3-No roll call vote. Mayor Kautz made the motion to approve Goal #2 as presented today, and Shirley Barnes seconded the motion. The vote to amend Goal #2 to include gender passed 11-Yes 0-No roll call vote. Note that the vote was conducted after Steve Ditschler excused himself due to attendance at another meeting. The vote to accept the recommendation to include additional data analysis for Asian and Native American Minnesotans passed on a roll call vote of 11-Yes 0-No.

**Meeting Adjournment** - Adjourned by acclamation at 11:50 a.m.

After the meeting, public comment was made and are recorded in these minutes. The public comment was received by a conference call participant in this special meeting, Joanne Hager. Joanne Hagar’s public comment was to support the inclusion of gender in Goals #1 and #2.